

**OFFICE OF THE ADDL. CHIEF ENGINEER-III,
RAJASTHAN HOUSING BOARD, JAIPUR**

No. ACE-III/2019-20/ 366

Date: 22.12.2019

Pre-Bid Minutes

A pre-bid meeting notice No. ACE-III/2019-20/275 dt. 17.12.2019 was issued to discuss & decide on queries raised by M/s DIMTS, M/s PWC and M/s EY regarding EOI No. 06/2019-20 for Transaction Advisor cum Financial Consultant for PPP projects and disposal of housing inventory with RHB on 23.12.2019 in the Board room at 11.30 PM under the chairmanship of HC Sir. Due to other meeting in the board room at the same time, the pre bid meeting was held in the ACE-III chamber with M/s PWC and M/s EY representative and no one was present from M/s DIMTS. Each query was discussed in detail and is decided as follows. Following were present in the meeting :-

1. Chief Engineer (HQ)/I/II, RHB, Jaipur.
2. Addl. Chief Engineer-I/III, RHB, Jaipur.
3. Financial Advisor, RHB, Jaipur. (Sh. M.K. Tholia)
4. Director Law, RHB, Jaipur. (Sh. Prashant Gupta)
5. Dy. Housing Commissioner, RHB, Circle-I/II/III, Jaipur.
6. TA to ACE-III, RHB, Jaipur.
7. M/s PWC, Sh. Arpit Agrawal
8. M/s EY, Sh. Sejal Mathur

M/s PWC, M/s EY and M/s DIMTS submitted request for clarifications in Expression of Interest (Eoi) for empanelment of Transaction Advisor cum Financial Consultant for PPP projects and disposal of unsold housing inventory with RHB all over Rajasthan. Which are mentioned below along with RHB view.

S.No	Ref (PWC)	Clarification	RHB View
1.	Clause 3.5 Page No 6, it is mentioned that a registered Power of Attorney needs to be submitted	We wish to submit that registering a power of attorney is a time taking task. We request you to kindly accept a Power of Attorney which is duly notarised. In notary, date of notrisation would be helpful if identifying the date of issuance of Power of Attorney. It is therefore, request to kindly delete the word 'registered'.	Registered power of attorney is required.
2.	Section 3 on Page No 7	As per the Section, five domain areas are mentioned from the consultants. As each of these domain areas requires varied expertise which would not be available within one consulting firm, we understand that a consulting firm may choose one or more specific area from these and get empanelled only for that specific activity. Kindly confirm.	Empanelment will be done as per eligibility criteria and method of selection based on the marks obtained.
3.	As per clause 4.1 on Page No 8, the consulting firms are required to provide an affidavit along with names of projects, and fee received	Request RHB to kindly provide a draft format for the same.	Draft format enclosed and uploaded on the E-proc site.

4.	As per clause 4.2 on Page No 8	We understand that a firm needs to showcase the annual turnover of more than 5 crores INR in any of the last 3 years (FY 2018-2019, FY 2017-2018, and FY 2016-2017). Given the prestige of this engagement, we feel that the criteria should be strengthened further to ensure only strong and credible firms participate in such an empanelment process thereby ensuring quality of the services. Therefore, we kindly request you to raise this criterion to 100 cr INR.	As per empanelment document
5.	As per clause 4.3 on Page No 8; Method of selection for empanelment	Although the scores are provided for each criterion, it is not clear on how each of the participating bidder would be scored. Request you to kindly clarify the same	Minimum 3 completed projects are required for being eligible under each category 10 marks for each domain area will be awarded to the firm. Who have completed 5 works of similar nature with required fee received for the project cost.
6.	As per clause 5.2 (iii) & (iv) on Page No 9	One needs to provide details of project undertaken by the firm in last five years and also the on-going ones. We understand that one needs to provide only the relevant and non-exhaustive list of projects. Kindly confirm	Relevant and non exhaustive list may be provided for domain area/ areas for which the firm is bidding.
7.	As per clause 5.2 (vii) on Page No 9	As per the clause, one needs to provide attested documents defining its legal status, structure and organisation, place of registration and principal place of firm, etc. We understand that here we just need to provide a notarised copy of incorporation certificate and rest details in as-is formats, as it may not be possible to obtain attested version of organisational structure, etc. Kindly confirm	All the documents should have signature of authorized signatory of the firm on each of the papers pertaining to this clause.
8.	Point No 1, Annexure B on Page No 12	We understand that on this clause one can add more categories as Limited Companies are allowed to participate but same is not been reflected here. Kindly confirm	Limited companies are allowed as per 3.5 page No. 6 of empanelment document.
9.	Point No 2, Annexure B on Page No 12	As per the format, one needs to provide address of Local Address. We understand that having a local office is not a mandatory condition for this empanelement. Kindly confirm	Local office is mandatory and rest of the detail is to be provided as per empanelment document.
10.	Point No 8, 9 10; Annexure B Page No 13	PwC is one of the India's leading consulting firm with yearly turnover of more than 2,500 cr INR in last two years with multiple on-going engagements. Its genesis in India is more than 100 years old. Given the size of the firm, it may not be possible for a firm like us to provide details of all the projects which were suspended, terminated.	A declaration may be provided by the bidding entity stating suspension / delay / incomplection / compensation imposed on any past projects under taken by it and which shall in no way have any adverse effect on the services to be provided under

		<p>foreclosed, delayed, incomplete, etc. If the objective of this clause is to assess the quality of the work, your good office may ask the bidding entities to provide an undertaking on barring/blacklisting by any government institution which subsist even on due date</p> <p>Request you to kindly modify the annexure.</p>	<p>this empanelment</p> <p>An overall under taking is required on issues of having been debarred/ blacklisted by any government institution which subsist on stipulated date of submission of the bid would result into disqualification.</p>
11.	<p>point no5,6 Annexure C Page No 14</p>	<p>As per the point, a firm needs to provide annual value of assignment undertaken in each of the last five years. If the objective of this clause is to ensure only sound and credible consulting firm participates in the bidding process, it will be better to strengthen the criteria as it will be very difficult for a large and multinational firm to produce this information accurately at any given point in time.</p> <p>Request your kind considerations please</p>	<p>As per document</p>
12.	<p>Point No 8 Annexure C page no14</p>	<p>Kindly clarify the meaning of 'bidding facilities' in this point.</p>	<p>Bidding facilities means taking part in the bidding process.</p>
13.	<p>Point No1 Annexure D Page No 15</p>	<p>As per the existing format, one has to provide yearly cumulative sqm of PPP projects undertaken in last 5 years. Please note that this indicator would not be an appropriate indicator for assessing the quality and capability of bidder as many a times completion certificate is not issued by the client in the manner as desired by the consultants or mentioning all the details. Moreover, for a large organisation like ours, more than 1,000 people are working in government advisory engagement and many of these have PPP component. In view of this, it may be more appropriate to check the number of years of experience and PPP transactions in last 5 years</p> <p>Similarly, for other criteria also, a limit of number of engagements (rather than quantity of output) may be defined by the Board which may help it evaluate the expression of interests.</p> <p>Request your kind consideration on the same</p>	<p>As per empanelment document.</p>
14	<p>Point No 2 of Annexure D on Page No 15</p>	<p>We understand that the bidding entity needs to mention about 3 projects per domain area (for example - 3 related to transaction advisory and/or financial management of PPP projects, 3 related to disposal of unsold inventory & its successful disposal, etc).</p> <p>Further, we understand that this format is</p>	<p>Agreed not required for each of the project</p>

		required for each of the five individual domain areas and CA certificate is required for the entire format covering all these projects rather than for each project individually.	
15.	Annexure E on Page No 18	<p>We understand that the firm needs to provide details of similar projects in progress and bid submitted as on date of submission of Application.</p> <p>We wish to submit that for a large multi-disciplinary and multi-national firm, it may not be possible to provide these details accurately as there are multiple bids that are submitted on daily basis and it is almost impossible to keep a track of all the proposals submitted centrally. Moreover, these informations are generally sought at the time of proposal submission to assess whether the bidding entity has sufficient capacity to undertake the task. Since this is an empanelment, we request you to kindly delete this Annexure.</p>	Details of projects pertaining to domain area as per scope of work page No. 7 to be provided with 5 project for each domain in descending order of amounts
16.	Annexure F on Page No 19	<p>As per the format, the bidding firm is required to submit details of various kinds of experts available with it including assistants. We request you to kindly accept number of such resources as large firms might have these resources in huge numbers and it may not be possible to provide details of all these resources.</p> <p>Request your kind consideration on this please</p>	<p>The word paid assistant shall be recorded as electrical engineers (Degree holder) and only numbers may be provided in other category those who are relevant to the bid may be mentioned</p>
17.	Annexure G on Page No 20	<p>Given the size of our firm and kind of the businesses we are in, it may not be possible for us to provide an exhaustive list of litigation history as many of these are sensitive information.</p> <p>In view of this, kindly request your consent to use the verbiage given below under the head of "Details of Litigation History":</p> <p>"The bidding entity for this engagement is PricewaterhouseCoopers Private Limited ("PwCPL" or "we"). PwCPL is a private limited company registered under the Companies Act, 1956, and we are engaged in providing professional services in the areas of tax, consulting and business advisory. I, XXXXXXX, Partner of PwCPL, do hereby declare to the best of our knowledge and information available with us as on date, that other than certain litigations/arbitration against PwCPL which are not material in nature, there are no other litigations pending against PwCPL. Further, there are no pending litigations/arbitration against PwCPL which if adversely determined, would impact the ability of PwCPL to provide services under the proposed tender."</p>	<p>An undertaking by the respective bidding entity may be submitted indicating that any pending litigations/ arbitration against bidding entity which if adversely determined, would not impact the ability of bidding entity to provide services under the proposed empanelment.</p>

18		There are several pages of the Eoi documents such as Page No 5, 6, 9, and 10, in the end of the Page, 'Signature of Applicant (Including title of capacity)' is mentioned. We understand these are typos. Kindly confirm	All the pages of EOI documents are to be signed by authorized signatory of the bidding entity.
19		We understand that consortiums are also allowed to participate in the Empanelment process. Kindly confirm	As per page 6 point No. 3.4.
20		Request you to kindly extend the due date by at least 3 weeks post issuance of clarifications	Due date for online submission is extended upto 25 Feb. 2020 and shall be opened as per online information

Queries from DIMTS firm :

S.No	Ref (Clause)	Description	Query/ Request for Clarification/ Suggestion	RHB View
1.	Clause No.4.3, S.No.2, Page No.8	Work Experience "For disposal of unsold housing inventory with RHB all over Rajasthan"	This clause is very restrictive in nature as it restricts the participants who have experience of transaction advisory in sectors other than housing and having experience in similar assignments with organizations other than RHB. Hence, it may be removed.	Word RHB shall be read as PSU/ Govt. institution.
2.	Clause No.4.3, S.No.5, Page No.8	Work Experience "For preparation of engineering consultancy & DPR for design of external electrification, water supply & sewerage system of New housing schemes"	The expertise required for engineering consultancy for infrastructure projects is higher than what is required for housing projects. Therefore, request you to kindly change this clause as follows: "For preparation of engineering consultancy & DPR for design of external electrification, water supply & sewerage system of infrastructure projects".	As per empanelment document
3.	Annexure-B, Clause No.6, S.No.4, Page No.13	Experience "Advisory services on rules & procedures, study of organizational structure of RHB for easy, quick, efficient, public friendly"	This clause is not clear and restricts participation of organizations who have similar experience with organizations other than RHB. Kindly explain the reasoning behind the same or preferably remove this requirement.	Please read as "Advisory services on the rules & procedures, study of government organization/ PSU for easy quick efficient public friendly."

EY QUERIES

S.No	Ref (Clause)	Description	Query for Clarification	RHB View
1.	Page 6 Clause 3.5	If the application is made by a limited company or corporation, it should be signed by duly authorized person Holding power of attorney for signing the application in which case a certified copy of Registered power of attorney shall accompany the application, Such limited company or corporation may be required to furnish satisfactory evidence of its existence before the empanelment application is filled.	Request you to clarify whether the authorised signatory in whose name the PoA is required must be the same as the person in whose name the DSC is registered for online uploading.	May or may not be the same.

2.	Page 8 Clause 4.1 & Page 17	Transaction advisor cum financial management for PPP projects and disposal of housing inventory must have worked upon more than 3 Projects of similar nature in State/ Central Govt. Department & PSU/ private group. (an affidavit along with name of projects and their fee received is to be submitted)	Request you to clarify whether affidavit/CA certificate is required only for completed projects or projects in progress as well	Affidavit for completed projects to be signed by authorized signatory of the bidding entity
3.	Page 9 Clause 5.1	The applicant in the same name or with partner should be empanelled in the govt. organization or Pvt. / PUS organization prior to date of publication of EOI.	Request you to confirm the text: The applicant in the same name or with partner should be empanelled in ... the govt. organization' or 'any govt. organization'	Word PUS to be read as PSU.
4.	Page 13 S.No. 2	Disposal of housing inventory with RHB all over Rajasthan.	Text contradicting with that mentioned under Scope of Work on Page 7 Point 3 (b) i.e. Disposal of housing inventory & success:- We understand that the experience required is not limited to Rajasthan Housing Board and that similar scope of work in assignments carried out by us with any other State Housing Board / any Govt. agency can also be considered. Request you to please confirm the same.	The word shall be read as govt. / Govt. organization/ PSU.
5.	Page 13 S.No. 4	Advisory services on rules & procedures, study of organizational structure of RHB for easy, quick, efficient, public friendly	Text contradicting with that mentioned under Scope of Work on Page 7 Point 3 (d) For Preparation of DPR for Advisory Services We understand that the experience required is not limited to Rajasthan Housing Board and that similar scope of work in assignments carried out by us with any other State Housing Board / any Govt. agency can also be considered Request you to please confirm the same.	Please read as "Advisory services on the rules & procedures, study of government organization/ PSU for easy quick efficient public friendly.
6.	Page 13 Points 8, 9, 10	8. Were any of your project suspended after commencement. If so, give the reasons thereof 9. Have you ever not completed any project awarded, if so, give the name of the project and reasons for not completing the project. 10. How many of your projects were delayed and compensation imposed. Please give details	EY being a large and multi-disciplinary organisation it is difficult to provide such information in a brief time period considering submission date. However, if such details may inevitably be required, we shall try to arrange for the same at a later date. Request you to please confirm the same.	A declaration may be provided by the bidding entity stating suspension / delay / incompleteness / compensation imposed on any past projects undertaken by it and which shall in no way have any adverse effect on the services to be provided under this empanelment. An overall under taking is required on issues of having been debarred/ blacklisted by any government institution which subsist on stipulated

			date of submission of the bid would result into disqualification
7.	Corrigendum Clause 3	Date of Bid Upload: 18.12.2019	Considering the list of Financial and Legal documents required to be furnished as part of EOI response submission, request you to kindly extend the bid submission date by 2 weeks i.e. from 18 December 2019 to 1 Jan 2020
			Due date for online submission is extended upto 25 Feb. 2020 and shall be opened as per online information.

Jurisdiction of dispute shall be at Jaipur and in the event of any dispute, whatsoever shall arise in any way shall be referred for decision to the empowered standing committee as per clause 23 of RHB agreement. Copy of affidavit is enclosed.

This bears the approval of competent authority.


Additional Chief Engineer-III

Copy to:

- 1- PS to Hon'ble Chairman/Housing Commissioner, Rajasthan Housing Board, Jaipur.
- 2- Chief Engineer-I/II/HQ, Rajasthan Housing Board, Jaipur.
- 3- Financial Advisor, RHB, Jaipur.
- 4- Director Law, RHB, Jaipur.
- 5- Dy. Housing Commissioner, RHB, Circle-I/II/III, Jaipur.
- 6- Joint Director (Computer), Rajasthan Housing Board, Jaipur for uploading the same on website.
- 7- Resident Engineer, e-proc, Rajasthan Housing Board, Jaipur for uploading the same on website.
- 8- M/s PWC, Sh. Arpit Agarwal (arpit.agarwal@pwc.com)
- 9- M/s EY, Sh. Sejal Mathur (Sejal.Mathur@in.ey.com)
- 10- M/s DIMTS (gaurav.shrivastava@dimts.in)
- 11- M/s Credible (credible.headoffice@gmail.com)
- 12- Master file.


TA to Additional Chief Engineer-III

AFFIDAVIT

IS/o aged about R/o
registered Power of attorney holder of the Applicant Firm M/s
executed on .../.../2020 do hereby solemnly affirm and declare as under.

1. That I am the power of attorney holder of the Applicant Firm, which is in force till today, hence I am competent to depose.
2. That the documents filed along with the application are true and originals copies.
3. That the contents of the Para No. 1 to 2 of the above affidavit are true to my knowledge and nothing material has been concealed there from.

DEPONENT

Verification

Verified at on this day of,2020 that the contents of the above affidavit are true and correct and nothing material has been concealed there from.

DEPONENT